

**APPENDIX 10**Meta-analysis tables – description of layout of detailed tables, and list of tables.

For each meta-analysis, summary results Tables of key analyses are presented at the end of the relevant chapter, while the full detailed versions of all the analyses are available as Appendix Tables at [www.pnlee.co.uk/etsast.htm](http://www.pnlee.co.uk/etsast.htm). Selected analyses are also presented as Figures. The layouts of the summary Tables and Figures have been described in §7.10.3 of the book, and the Appendix Tables are described here.

Each detailed table comes in eight sections preceded by a cover page. All the pages for the meta-analysis are given the same main table number and main heading (describing the analysis), with the section number blank for the cover page and 1 to 8 for the specific section (e.g. Table C3-5 is section 5 within Table C3). The content of each section is as follows:

- Cover page :      This shows
- (i)      restrictions on the data included,
  - (ii)     the order of preference for selecting RRs to be included,  
          and
  - (iii)    a short description of the contents of the table
- Note that Sections 1 to 3 concern “adjusted data,” with RRs adjusted for the most potential confounders chosen from a study, while Sections 4 to 6 concern “unadjusted data,” with RRs adjusted for the least potential confounders chosen from a study.
- Section 1 :        For each adjusted RR selected, a listing of their relevant characteristics. This includes the values of certain variables used to select the RR and used as “factors” in Section 3, as well as the two key identifiers of the RR: the study 6-character reference (REF) and the number of the RR within that study (NRR). It also may indicate where RRs differ from those in another table – for example, if table C1 presented lifetime asthma analyses not restricted by age and table C35 presented lifetime asthma analyses restricted to age below 10 years, a character "x" in a column headed "Comp C1" in the output for table C35-1 would indicate

those studies where the RR estimates in tables C1 and C35 actually differ.

Section 2 : For each adjusted RR selected, the output shows in the first part of the section the sex, the number of potential confounding variables adjusted for, the  $2 \times 2$  table of results (where available), the RR with its 95% CI, and in the second part of the section  $Y_s$ ,  $W_s$ ,  $Q_s$  and  $P_s$  (the logarithm of the RR, the weight, heterogeneity contribution and P value, as defined in §7.10.2). Where multiple independent estimates are available for a study (typically different sexes or age groups), combined results are also shown for the study. Note that the  $2 \times 2$  table is headed “exposed/non-exposed”  $\times$  “case/control”. Exposed and non-exposed are as defined in the cover page and include any comparison (e.g. mother smoked vs mother did not smoke). Control refers to numbers at risk or person-years for prospective studies, indicated by an asterisk (\*) in the left-hand margin, and to disease-free subjects in cross-sectional studies. RRs calculated by adding 0.5 to each cell (where a zero is present) are indicated by a tilde (~). Section 2 ends with the results of a meta-analysis of the overall data, identical to that shown at the start of section 3 and described below.

Section 3 : This gives the results of fixed effects and random effects meta-analyses of the adjusted data. The section starts with an analysis of the data overall, followed by analyses for the data subdivided by sex and by various other factors. The output indicates (again as defined in §7.10.2) the number of estimates combined (N), the number of studies from which these estimates come (NS), the weight for the studies combined (Wt), the heterogeneity chisquared (Het Chi) and its P value, as well as the RRs and CIs themselves (RR, RRI, RRu) and their P values from both the Fixed and Random effects models. The overall analysis also shows the P value for Egger’s test of publication bias (Asymm P, Egger et al., 1997), while the analyses subdivided by factor level include, at the bottom of the “Total” column, the chisquared value

for the difference between the fixed effects RR estimates for the factor levels (Between Chi) and its P value.

P values are coded as +++, --- or \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$ ; ++, -- or \*\*  $p < 0.01$ ; +, - or \*  $p < 0.05$ ; (+), (-) or (\*)  $p < 0.1$  and N.S.  $p > 0.1$ , with plus signs indicating significant positive differences or RRs greater than 1, minus signs indicating significant negative differences or RRs less than 1, and asterisks indicating significant non-directional heterogeneity.

Sections 4 to 6 : As for Sections 1 to 3 but for unadjusted data. A column headed X indicates, in the section 4 output, by entries of X against specific RRs, those that differ from the corresponding adjusted RRs. Typically, an X will not be entered where a study only has one relevant RR available, adjusted or unadjusted but not both. Generally a shorter set of factors is used in section 6 than in section 3.

Section 7 : This lists the studies excluded from consideration, together with information on the stage at which they were excluded. The stage refers back to the various restriction and selection stages described in the cover page. A study is excluded when no RR can be found to satisfy the criteria required.

Section 8<sup>1</sup> : This lists potentially overlapping studies for which data have been included, and also any results which would have been included in preference except that they had incomplete data (typically an RR without a CI).

Note that the main results are given in Sections 3 and 6 while Sections 1, 2, 4, 5, 7 and 8 mainly provide detailed information only required when one wants to see the individual estimates or to check precisely which studies and RRs have been selected. Only selected parts of the Section 2 results are given in the Figures, and of

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 8 is incorporated in section 7 for the adult analyses

the Section 3 results in the Tables included in the book, and the full output is made available as Appendix Tables at [www.pnlee.co.uk/etsast.htm](http://www.pnlee.co.uk/etsast.htm).

A list of all the analyses carried out is given below. Only certain key tables are included in the book, as indicated by an entries in the “Page (Table)” and “Page (Figure)” columns. The numbering of the Tables and their corresponding Appendix Tables is always consistent, so that the numbering of Tables in the book is not consecutive. Terms used here to describe the outcome, exposure (source, time, dose) and non-exposure are defined in §7.10.5. The factors considered are described in §7.10.6 (their levels only being shown in abbreviated form in the tables). The factors actually used varies between the various analyses, and generally a shorter set of factors is used in the non-key tables than in the key tables.

**Table A and Appendix Table A**  
Adults, any exposure

	Outcome (asthma)	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Ex-smokers	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
A1	lifetime/current	total (or nearest)	earliest	included	208	182	A1
A2	lifetime/current	total (or nearest)	earliest	excluded	210		A22
A3	lifetime/current	total (or nearest)	most recent	included	211		A32
A4	lifetime/current	total (or nearest), preferring maternal	childhood	included	212		A45
A5	lifetime/current	total (or nearest), preferring paternal	childhood	included	213		A57
A6	current/lifetime	total (or nearest)	earliest	included	214		A69
A7	lifetime/current	household	earliest	included	215		A82
A8	lifetime/current	household	most recent	included	216		A94
A9	lifetime/current	workplace	earliest	included	217	187	A106
A10	lifetime/current	workplace	most recent	included	218		A118

**Table B and Appendix Table B**  
Adults, by amount of exposure

	Exposure (source)	Dose	Measure of dose	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
B1	total (or nearest)	low	cigs/hours	219	188	B1
B2	total (or nearest)	high	cigs/hours	219	188	B11
B3	household	low	cigs/hours	219		B21
B4	household	high	cigs/hours	219		B26
B5	workplace	low	cigs/hours	220		B31
B6	workplace	high	cigs/hours	220		B36
B7	total (or nearest)	low	pkyrs/cigs/hours	221		B41
B8	total (or nearest)	high	pkyrs/cigs/hours	221		B51
B9	household	low	pkyrs/cigs/hours	221		B61
B10	household	high	pkyrs/cigs/hours	221		B66
B11	workplace	low	pkyrs/cigs/hours	222		B71
B12	workplace	high	pkyrs/cigs/hours	222		B76

**Table C and Appendix Table C**  
**Children, any exposure during the child's lifetime**

	Outcome (asthma)	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Non-exposure	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
C1	lifetime	total	general	most	353	268	C1
C2	lifetime	total	general	least			C33
C3	current	total	general	most	356	274	C43
C4	current	total	general	least			C71
C5	lifetime	parent	general	most	360		C80
C6	lifetime	parent	general	least			C109
C7	current	parent	general	most	364		C118
C8	current	parent	general	least			C142
C9	lifetime	total	recent	most			C149
C10	lifetime	total	recent	least			C159
C11	current	total	recent	most			C169
C12	current	total	recent	least			C178
C13	lifetime	parent	recent	most			C187
C14	lifetime	parent	recent	least			C196
C15	current	parent	recent	most			C205
C16	current	parent	recent	least			C212
C17	lifetime	total	earliest	most			C219
C18	lifetime	total	earliest	least			C229
C19	current	total	earliest	most			C239
C20	current	total	earliest	least			C248
C21	lifetime	parent	earliest	most			C257
C22	lifetime	parent	earliest	least			C266
C23	current	parent	earliest	most			C275
C24	current	parent	earliest	least			C282
C25	lifetime/ current	total	general	most	368		C289
C26	lifetime/ current	parent	general	most	372		C329
C27	current/ lifetime	total	general	most			C360
C28	current/ lifetime	parent	general	most			C374
C29	onset	total	general	most			C384
C30	onset	parent	general	most			C390
C31	lifetime-physician	total	general	most	376		C396
C32	lifetime-physician	parent	general	most			C423
C33	current-physician	total	general	most	380		C430
C34	current-physician	parent	general	most			C454
C35	lifetime age<10	total	general	most			C460
C36	lifetime age inc 10	total	general	most			C467
C37	lifetime age > 10	total	general	most			C476
C38	lifetime age<10	parent	general	most			C482
C39	lifetime age inc 10	parent	general	most			C488
C40	lifetime age > 10	parent	general	most			C496
C41	lifetime	both parents	general	most	384		C501
C42	lifetime	both parents	general	least			C522
C43	current	both parents	general	most	388		C527
C44	current	both parents	general	least			C549
C45	lifetime	mother/mother only	general	most	392		C555
C46	lifetime	mother/mother only	general	least			C582
C47	current	mother/mother only	general	most	396		C590
C48	current	mother/mother only	general	least			C614
C49	lifetime	mother only	general	most			C621
C50	lifetime	mother only	general	least			C626
C51	current	mother only	general	most			C631
C52	current	mother only	general	least			C637
C53	lifetime	father/father only	general	most	400		C643
C54	lifetime	father/father only	general	least			C668
C55	current	father/father only	general	most	404		C675
C56	current	father/father only	general	least			C699
C57	lifetime	father only	general	most			C706
C58	lifetime	father only	general	least			C711
C59	current	father only	general	most			C716
C60	current	father only	general	least			C722

	Outcome (asthma)	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Non-exposure	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
C61	lifetime	Hh other than parent	general	most			C728
C62	lifetime	Hh other than parent	general	least			C733
C63	current	Hh other than parent	general	most			C738
C64	current	Hh other than parent	general	least			C744
C65	lifetime	not mother	general	most	408		C750
C66	lifetime	not mother	general	least			C773
C67	current	not mother	general	most	412		C779
C68	current	not mother	general	least			C801
C69	lifetime	total	discontinued	most	416		C807
C70	current	total	discontinued	most	420		C830

Hh = household member

Table D and Appendix Table D  
Children, by amount of exposure during lifetime

	Outcome (asthma)	Dose	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Non-exposure	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
D1	lifetime	low	total	general	most	424	286	D1
D2	lifetime	high	total	general	most	424	286	D10
D3	current	low	total	general	most	425	288	D19
D4	current	high	total	general	most	425	288	D28
D5	lifetime/current	low	total	general	most	426		D37
D6	lifetime/current	high	total	general	most	426		D48

Table E and Appendix Table E  
Children, any exposure *in utero*

	Outcome (asthma)	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Non-exposure	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
E1	lifetime/current	mother	in utero	most	427	291	E1
E2	current/lifetime	mother	in utero	most			E24
E3	lifetime/current	motherETS/father	in utero	most			E31

Table F and Appendix Table F  
Children, by amount of exposure *in utero*

	Outcome (asthma)	Dose	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Non-exposure	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
F1	lifetime/current	low	total	in utero	most	430	294	F1
F2	lifetime/current	high	total	in utero	most	430	294	F10

Table G and Appendix Table G  
Children, joint effects of *in utero* and in life exposure

	Outcome (asthma)	Exposure (source)	Exposure (time)	Non-exposure	Page (Table)	Page (Figure)	Page (Appendix Table)
G1	lifetime/current	mother	in utero only	neither	431		G1
G2	lifetime/current	total	in life only	neither	431		G10
G3	lifetime/current	total <u>and</u> mother	in life <u>and</u> in utero	neither	431		G19
G4	current/lifetime	mother	in utero only	neither			G28
G5	current/lifetime	total	in life only	neither			G34
G6	current/lifetime	total <u>and</u> mother	in life <u>and</u> in utero	neither			G40